# Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Presenter(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.30pm</td>
<td>Registration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.00pm</td>
<td>Welcome address / Tax Bites / FD App</td>
<td>Michael Dawson/Tom Minnikin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10pm</td>
<td>Employee Share Ownership - Setting the Scene</td>
<td>Michelle Hogan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.40pm</td>
<td>EMI Share Options – Hurdles and Benefits</td>
<td>Andrew Marr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.55pm</td>
<td>Green Sky Energy Limited - Use of Share Options</td>
<td>Simon Oldfield</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15pm</td>
<td><strong>Coffee Break</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.40pm</td>
<td>Employee Shareholder Status</td>
<td>Haydn Rogan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10pm</td>
<td>Using shares to pay dividends to employees</td>
<td>Tom Minnikin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.30pm</td>
<td>Realising the capital value for the employee</td>
<td>Michael Dawson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.50pm</td>
<td>Questions to the floor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.00pm</td>
<td>Closing remarks followed by drinks</td>
<td>Michael Dawson</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Employee Share Ownership - Setting the Scene

MICHELLE HOGAN
Senior Tax Consultant
T: 0161 927 5674
E: michelle@forbesdawson.co.uk
What’s covered:

• Overview – changing climate of employee share ownership

• Unapproved arrangements

• History of approved schemes

• Enterprise Management Incentive Scheme (EMI)

• Employee Shareholder Status
Two ways of getting value to employees:

- **Salary / Bonus**
  - **Income tax & NI**
    - IT: 40% / 45%

- **Company Shares**
  - **Dividends**
    - Income tax: 25% / 30.56%
  - **Capital**
    - CGT: 10%...?
Why use share plans?

• Longer term incentives
  - linking rewards to shareholder value
  - motivating employees to build value
  - Lock-in employees for an exit

• Shorter term incentives
  - Linking rewards to results
  - Attractiveness of dividends over salary / bonuses
The changing climate of share ownership

Management pay & incentives

- Changing over last 10 years
- Historically a contentious area
- ‘Cat & mouse’ legislative measures
- Negative press
- 2012 push to more employee ownership & Nuttall report
- FA2013 changes
The changing climate of share ownership

“...too few people have capital...We need more individuals to have a real stake in their firms. More of a John Lewis economy... Firms that have engaged employees, who own a chunk of their company...[have] weathered the economic downturn better than other companies...”

Nick Clegg, January 2012
Two ways of giving equity stakes to employees

- **Approved schemes**
  - Available to all employees
    - SAYE
    - SIPS
  - Selective
    - EMI
- **Unapproved schemes**
  - Employee shareholder status
Private companies – most commonly used schemes

- Approved schemes
  - Selective
    - EMI
  - Employee shareholder status...

- Unapproved schemes
  - Selective
  - Outright transfer of shares
Unapproved schemes – outright transfer of shares

How it works:

• Governed by employment related securities (ERS) legislation, 2003
• Income tax where shares acquired at undervalue
• No tax where UMV for shares paid on issue
• S.431 election ensures subsequent increases subject to CGT, not income tax

£nil paid on issue

MV=£100

Tax £40

Ltd
Unapproved schemes – outright transfer of shares

**Pros**

- Selective
- Increased popularity on abolition of taper relief in 2008
- Loan interest relief may be available on borrowings to acquire shares

**Cons**

- Penal tax regime
- Value of shares cannot usually be agreed with HMRC in advance
- Risk if business hits buffers – amount paid on shares lost
Unapproved schemes – outright transfer of shares

Partly paid shares / Nil paid shares

- Uncalled amount is a loan
- BIK under ITEPA 2003 on beneficial loan, at 3.25%, but:
  - Can be avoided if interest relief under ITA 2007 s383 – cancels out tax
  - BUT – share capital is payable if company gets into difficulty
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Overview of current EMI rules (1)

• Independent, ‘qualifying’ trading companies with:
  - Gross assets < £30 million
  - Full-time equivalent employees < 250

• Eligible employees
  - No material interest i.e. < 30%
  - Min 25 hours / week or 75% of working time
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Overview of current EMI rules (2)

• No income tax or NI on:
  - Grant of options to acquire shares at exercise price
  - Exercise of options within 10 years of grant

• CGT on disposal of shares
  - 10% of CGT with Entrepreneurs’ Relief
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Timeline overview

- 2012 – Nuttall Review, OTS promotion of EO by government leading to FA2013 changes

Use Of Shares and Share Options To Reward And Incentivise Employees
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Early years

- Taper relief replaced indexation for individuals’ capital gains
- Business Asset Taper Relief (BATR) – effective 10% rate of CGT on share disposals
- BATR – min 2 year holding period
- EMI introduced in 2000 – no tax until disposal of asset
- BATR holding period started on grant of option – effective 10% CGT rate
- CT relief: market value – price paid by employee
- Low set up / admin costs
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Declining popularity

- Flat rate of 18% CGT replaces taper relief, followed by 28% higher rate in 2010
- Effective 10% CGT rate no longer easily attainable on share sales
- Introduction of Entrepreneurs’ Relief – min 5% shareholding requirement
- Climate of negative press surrounds management incentives
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Government backing & legislative changes from 2012

- 2012 Govt reviews
  - Nuttall, OTS

- FA 2013
  - Changes to EMI
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Government backing & legislative changes from 2012

• Government promotion of employee ownership (EO)

• 2012 Nuttall Review finds evidence based benefits from EO
  - Improved business performance
  - Increased economic resilience
  - Greater employee engagement & commitment
  - Enhanced employee well-being & reduced absenteeism

• Barriers to EO includes:
  - Lack of awareness of concept of employee ownership
  - Lack of awareness amongst legal, tax & accountancy advisors
  - Actual & perceived legal, tax & regulatory complexities
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

FA 2013 changes mean..

.....back to (potentially) 10% CGT on share disposal with ER!
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Private companies and share schemes:

? Limited value for minority shareholdings in private companies...
  • Lack of immediate market to sell shares
  • Income subject to discretion of directors

✓ Evidence based benefits of participation in success of company – involvement
✓ Legislation changes and flexibility of EMI
✓ Flexibility of reward – dividends far better than bonuses
History of approved schemes – changing popularity of EMI

Conclusion:

EMI is now a ‘no-brainer’ if all the requisite conditions are met!
What if the criteria for EMI are not met..?

Company...

- too big?
- subsidiary?
- excluded activities? e.g:
  - property development
  - banking, insurance, leasing...
  - legal & accountancy services
Employee shareholder status – main points

• Main uses
  - When EMI conditions (e.g. trading requirements) not met
  - Where short term sale and no ER (eg. sale taking place within a year)

• Forfeiture of statutory rights (unfair dismissal and lesser)

• Value between £2,000 and £50,000 – no CGT on disposal

• Anything over £2,000 subject to income tax and NI on acquisition

• No material interest i.e. < 25%

• No tax deduction in company
EMI Share Options – Hurdles and Benefits

ANDREW MARR
Director
T: 0161 927 3854
E: andrew@forbesdawson.co.uk
Overview

• How do EMI options typically work?
• Valuation Issues
• Tax Benefits
• Company Qualifications
• Employee Qualifications
• Exercise Events
• Questions
How do EMI Options Work?

• Agree value now

• For employees to buy shares in the future (if they want)

• On the occasion of an exit event

• Grant means issue of the option / exercise means share acquisition under terms of the option

• HMRC agree that all subject to capital gains tax (at 28% or 10%)
How do EMI Options Work?

- Straight gift of shares, unapproved options, employee shareholder status, others
- Not always necessary but some marginal cases (e.g., asset backed trades, issues of independence)
- Generally trying to get HMRC to agree low value (maximise minority discounts)
- Usually grant with exercise price on ‘exit event’ being current market value
- Cash not usually paid out. Employee receives profit element.

Consider different rewards

Get HMRC clearance for company

HMRC agrees Valuation

Grant of options

Exercise on sale
Valuation Issues

• Agree upfront (before grant) with HMRC
• Change in HMRC procedure

Typical Steps

1. Calculate ‘maintainable earnings’
2. Apply suitable multiple
3. Relate global value to share structure (growth shares etc)
4. Minority discounts (try for 90% discount)
5. HMRC negotiation
Example Valuation

Take trading company with ‘maintainable earnings’ of £500,000 issuing EMI options over 10% of shares.

- Maintainable earnings: £500,000
- Value using a multiple of 6: £3m
- Pro-rata value of 10%: £300,000
- Value of 10% taking a 90% discount: £30,000
Valuation Issues

- Actual Market Value (AMV) v Unrestricted Market Value (UMV)

- Forfeiture, minimum holding requirements are restrictions

- Agree value for each

- HMRC sometimes agree AMV = UMV / sometimes insist on 10% add on for unrestricted
EMI Tax Benefits

EMI ‘Profit’

- 10% Tax for option holder
- CT deduction for company (at least 20%)

(FA 2003 Sch 23)
EMI Tax Benefits

- Eg. £10m company issues options over 10% of shares

Use Of Shares and Share Options To Reward And Incentivise Employees
EMI Tax Benefits

Example
- £10m company
- 10% share options
- Current share value £200,000 (taking 80% discount)
- £800,000 profit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EMI</th>
<th>Employee Shareholder Status</th>
<th>Unapproved Share Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee tax liability (assume Entrepreneurs’ Relief)</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>360,000 (at 45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Company tax saving (assume 20% rate)</td>
<td>(160,000)</td>
<td>(160,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net tax (total)</td>
<td>(80,000)</td>
<td>200,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EMI Tax Benefits

- No tax on grant

- No income tax ever unless option granted at a discount (unusual)

- No tax on exercise (assuming no discount at grant)

- Tax on sale but at what rate? (10% with Entrepreneurs’ Relief/otherwise 28%)
EMI Tax Benefits

Entrepreneurs’ Relief

- 5% problem has been removed (5% voting power, share capital requirement)
- Year shareholding requirement removed
- But no ER between 5/4/08 and 5/4/13 (usually 28%)
- Just need 12 months from date of grant to sale
- Other ER conditions need to be met
Lesser known Tax Benefits

- Employee 2% shareholding subscription – Plan A
- EMI option grant at market value followed by immediate exercise – Plan B

(Assume market value paid)

**Plan A**
- No Entrepreneurs’ Relief
- If restricted, income tax charges

**Plan B**
- Entrepreneurs’ Relief!
- No restricted securities issues
Company Qualifications

- Independence (not under control of other company) (Venture capital firms)
- Property managing subsidiaries (must be 90% owned) – strange rule
- Qualifying subsidiaries – controlled company must be 51% subsidiary (49% shares, 55% votes?) – again strange rule!
- Gross assets do not exceed £30m
  - all assets of subsidiary counted
  - No deduction for liabilities
  - Accounts basis
  - Goodwill
- UK permanent establishment requirement
Company Qualifications

• Number of employees
  - Introduced from 21 July 2008
  - Less than 250 full-time equivalent (at least 35 hours per week)
  - Don’t count maternity / paternity leave
  - Exclude apprentices
  - No averaging (based on time of grant)

• Also restricted to £3m of unexercised EMI options
Company Qualifications

Trading Activity Requirement

- Needs to be ‘substantially’ qualifying (80%)
Employee Qualifications

Employee of company or subsidiary

Working time requirement (25 hours average, or 75% of working time)

Granted by ‘reason of employment’ (when would this not be the case?)

No material interest
- No more than 30% ordinary shares
- Or entitlement to 30% of assets on a distribution
- Associates
- Count non-EMI options
Employee Qualifications

Individual Limits

• Unexercised qualifying EMI options cannot be worth more than £250,000 (only excess is non-qualifying)

• Market value at date of grant (exercise irrelevant)

• Parallel options?
  - Different options
  - Only one class can be exercised
  - ‘Only the maximum number of shares which may be acquired under either option need be counted’

• Not usually a problem
Exercise Events

Individual Limits

- Capable of exercise in 10 years
- Usually only exercisable on ‘exit events’ (third party sale)
- This doesn’t breach 10 year rule
- Generally flexible and no need for exit events
- Exercise and sale to company etc (later)
Examples of Flexible Exercise Conditions

- Exercisable on meeting specific performance targets
- Variable number of options exercisable at management discretion
- Exercise on almost unlimited variety of events
- Very few limitations
Eg. Sales staff

• 10,000 share options (subject to value)

• Number exercisable based on sales figures

• (possibly management discretion)

• Need internal market (later........)

• 10% if sold after a year

Performance related bonus

• Taxed at 45% (top rate)
Any Questions?
Use Of Shares And Share Options To Reward And Incentivise Employees

Green Sky Energy Limited - use of share options
Background

- Green Sky Energy Limited formed in 2010:
  - Plan to create the UK’s leading energy management and carbon reduction business
  - Private equity backed
  - Grown in 3 years from shell company to:
    - £50m+ turnover
    - 350 employees
    - Blue chip customer base
  - Trades as “Matrix: Sustainable Energy Efficiency”
Provision of services to customers with large building estates and a desire to reduce their energy consumption
Background

• Business was 100% acquired by E.ON in October 2013:
  – Created exit for Lloyds Development Capital
  – Business plan developed with existing management team to continue growing the business
  – Provides access to E.ON customer base, finance and resources across Europe
My role

• Built infrastructure from zero base!
• Manage day to day finances
• M&A
• Stakeholder management
### Shareholding structure – early 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of individuals</th>
<th>Shareholding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lloyds Development Capital</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>46.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex shareholders of Matrix/DWEC</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original buy-in team</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unallocated shares</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nearly 50% of the company owned by 30 employees (total workforce at that time circa 170)
Challenges created by offering further employees direct share ownership

- Legal fees/documentation
- Companies House disclosure
- HMRC valuation
- Risk of creating PAYE liability
- Limited opportunity for Entrepreneur Relief
- High level of admin and aggravation associated with leaving shareholders
A potential solution

• Enterprise Management Incentives ("EMI")
  – tax advantaged share options

• Available to companies with:
  – No controlling parent company
  – gross assets below £30m
  – Less than 250 employees
  – Qualifying activities
EMI – how did it work for us?

• Scheme created/implemented in Autumn 2011
• Granted employees options to acquire shares for £1 each on an “exit event”
• £1 agreed with HMRC as the fair market value of the shares at the date the options were granted
• Options lapse if the employee leaves
EMI – how did it work for us?

• EMI options granted to 14 employees:
  – 2 existing shareholders
  – 12 others where retention/incentivisation was felt to be important to business success
  – Created shareholding interests between 0.12% and 1.5%

• Options granted over all unallocated shares plus others held by CEO
EMI – what was required to implement the scheme?

• Assessment to check eligibility
• Discussions with employees to explain why we would like to make them shareholders
• Relatively simple legal documentation
• Letter to HMRC to agree valuation
• Ongoing annual HMRC reporting
Questions from employees

• What will it cost me?
• What’s the impact on my ongoing remuneration package?
• How will it be taxed?
• Why are you not giving me real shares?
What was the outcome for the EMI option holders?

• 3 left the business:
  – Options lapsed on leaving
  – No legal documentation required
  – No cost to the business or the option holders
  – Freed up the CEO shares which had been subject to options
What was the outcome for the EMI option holders?

- Remaining 11 exercised their options when Green Sky Energy was sold to E.ON:
  - Cost them £16k in total to exercise the options
  - Received initial cash proceeds of £0.75m
  - Right to receive substantial additional consideration dependent on performance
  - Eligible for ER so capital gain taxable at 10% vs 28% for most other shareholders
What benefits did EMI offer us?

• Company
  – Simple to set up and administer
  – Flexibility vs direct share ownership
  – Secure employee loyalty with no P&L impact
  – Corporation tax deduction available when options exercised

• Employees
  – Incentive to stay with the business
  – Alignment with other shareholders
  – No cost to enter scheme
  – Tax efficient exit proceeds
Use Of Shares And Share Options To Reward And Incentivise Employees
Use of shares and share options to reward and incentivise employees - innovative strategies for your clients

Employee Shareholder Status

Haydn Rogan

7 July 2014
Employee Shareholder Status°
History and Background

- Announced by Government and consultation launched in October 2012
- Primarily aimed at small fast-growing companies that want a flexible workforce
  - Creates a third class of employment status - ‘employee owner’ (renamed “employee shareholder”)
  - Employee shareholders given shares in exchange for giving up certain statutory employment rights
- Idea is to create a more engaged workforce
- Legislative framework set out in Growth and Infrastructure Act 2013 and Finance Act 2013
- Came into effect on 1 September 2013
Directors/employees give up the following statutory employment rights:

- the right to a statutory redundancy payment;
- the right to claim unfair dismissal (except for reasons that are automatically unfair or which relate to discrimination);
- the right to request flexible working in certain circumstances;
- the right to request time off for study or training; and
- agree to an increase in the amount of notice they must give of their intention to return to work during the maternity/paternity leave period to 16 weeks (as opposed to 8 weeks/6 weeks),

In exchange they receive shares worth at least £2,000 (at the time of acquisition) in their employer (or its parent undertaking).

Employment rights can be given back on a contractual basis.
Tax treatment

- ESS shares attract both income tax (IT) and capital gains tax (CGT) reliefs
- Reliefs subject to conditions

**IT**

- First £2,000 worth of ESS shares exempt from IT and NICs.
- If given shares worth > £2,000 (immediate) IT charge on the excess
- No IT relief if employee (or a connected person) has or is entitled to acquire a material interest (25%) in the employer or parent undertaking (1 year look back)
- Exemption from usual IT charge on buyback of ESS shares (provided buyback takes place after termination of all employments and offices and shares qualify for ESS CGT relief).

**CGT**

- Disposal of ESS shares (valued at up to £50,000 at date of acquisition) is exempt from CGT
- No CGT relief if material interest (1 year look back)
- No exemption for inter spouse transfer of ESS shares and care required re share exchanges
Who can become an employee shareholder?

- Both existing or new employees can become employee shareholders
- Can be an employee of a UK or overseas company
- Existing employees cannot be required to become an employee shareholder (and have additional employment protections against being discriminated against or unfairly dismissed due to any refusal to do so)
- All other rights same as for employees
- Employee shareholder status not dependent upon continuing to hold the shares
- Tax benefits only if no material interest
Practical issues and considerations

- Need to check if shareholder authority required
- Can use any class or type of shares (can be non-voting shares)
- Shares can be subject to forfeiture if the employee leaves the company (eg good leaver / bad leaver)
- Need to consider forfeiture/buyback provisions in articles
- Shares must be issued fully paid up
- There can be no consideration for the shares (other than agreeing to become an employee shareholder)
- Mechanism for allotting shares (capitalise reserves or treat as issue for non cash consideration)
- May be technically possible to issue in tranches (but number of issues)
- Need to consider general directors duties (promote success of company for benefit of members as a whole)
Valuation

- Shares must be worth at least £2,000 at time of acquisition

- Problem for small / start up companies?

- May be able to underpin the £2,000 minimum valuation in other ways (HMRC appear relaxed)

- Process in place for agreeing valuation with HMRC Shares and Assets Valuation in advance of allotment
Procedure

- Provide employee with:
  - a written statement of particulars of the status of employee shareholder; and
  - a copy of the proposed contractual documentation/agreement to become an employee shareholder;

  – They must then receive advice from an independent adviser as to the terms and effect of the proposed agreement with the company (with the reasonable costs of this advice being met by the company); and

  – 7 days after they have received the independent advice the agreement can be entered into.
Written statement of particulars

Must include:

• A statement of the rights that the individual will not have as an employee shareholder
• The increased notice periods on returning early from maternity, adoption or additional paternity leave.
• What voting rights / dividend rights / rights to distribution of surplus assets attach to the ESS shares.
• If the company has more than one class of shares explain how the rights attaching to the ESS shares differ from the equivalent rights that attach to the shares in the largest (or next largest) class
• Whether the ESS shares are redeemable and any restrictions on transfer
• Whether the ESS shares are subject to drag along and tag along rights
• Whether any statutory pre-emption rights are excluded in the case of the ESS shares
Independent advice

- Once given written statement of particulars, individual must receive advice from an independent adviser as to terms and effect

- Reasonable costs of such advice to be met by company (whether or not take up offer to become employee shareholder)

- Independent adviser
  - Qualified lawyers
  - Officers, officials, employees or members of an independent trade union who have been certified by the union as competent to give advice and as authorised to do so on its behalf.
  - Those working at an advice centre (whether as an employee or a volunteer) who have been certified as competent to give advice and as authorised to do so on its behalf, provided the employee has not paid for the advice
  - Those specified in an order made by the Secretary of State (Fellows of the Institute of Legal Executives employed by a solicitors’ practice).

- No income tax charge (benefit in kind) on individual re payment of such costs by employer
When to consider ESS

- Company / individual does not qualify for EMI or other approved options due to:
  - size requirements
  - independence requirements
  - working time requirements

- To date most widely taken up in context of venture capital backed companies
  - CGT exemption as compared to 10% rate with benefit of Entrepreneurs’ Relief
  - No 5% or 12 month holding requirement
  - Loss of employment rights not as onerous for senior management
  - Can be used in overseas companies
  - No restriction on type of shares
Using shares to pay dividends to employees

TOM MINNIKIN
Senior Tax Consultant
T: 0161 927 3856
E: tom@forbesdawson.co.uk
Use of dividends as remuneration planning

What’s covered:

• Comparison of dividends vs salary
• Scenarios where dividend planning may be appropriate
• Methods
  - Spousal income splitting
  - Dividend waivers
  - Differential share classes
• Tax issues, anti-avoidance rules etc.
### Taxation of dividends v salary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Higher rate</th>
<th>Additional rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dividend paid (A)</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grossed up value (x 100/90)</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxation</td>
<td>x 32.5% = 3,250</td>
<td>x 37.5% = 3,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax credit</td>
<td>(1,000)</td>
<td>(1,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax payable (B)</td>
<td>2,250</td>
<td>2,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net receipt</td>
<td>6,750</td>
<td>6,250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective rate of tax (B/A)</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>30.56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Taxation of dividends v salary

Extra £100,000 to be extracted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SALARY</th>
<th>Higher rate</th>
<th>Additional rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profit before tax</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deduction for gross salary + Employers NIC</td>
<td>(100,000)</td>
<td>(100,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxable profits</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporation tax</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Employers NIC (13.8%)                            | 12,127      | 12,127          |
| Gross salary paid to employee                    | 87,873      | 87,873          |
| Employees NIC (12.8%)                            | (1,757)     | (1,757)         |
| Income tax (40%/45%)                             | (39,149)    | (39,543)        |
| **Net take home amount**                         | **50,967**  | **46,573**      |
| Combined effective rate of tax                   | **49.0%**   | **53.4%**       |
## Taxation of dividends v salary

Extra £100,000 to be extracted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DIVIDEND</th>
<th>Higher rate</th>
<th>Additional rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profit before tax</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporation tax (20%)</td>
<td>(20,000)</td>
<td>(20,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profits available for distribution</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income tax payable @ 25% = (20,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td>@ 30.56% = (24,448)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net receipt</td>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>55,552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective rate of tax</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saving compared to paying salary</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Taxation of dividends v salary

Tax planning optimum:

- Paying salary of up to £10,000 will make full use of personal allowances.
- Even better, pay salary at least up to the NIC secondary threshold (£7,956)
  - Ensures deemed contribution for social security without NIC cost

BUT:

- National minimum wage rules
- Pension issues
- May complicate matters with regard to obtaining finance (mortgages etc.)
Scenarios where dividend planning may be appropriate

- Husband and wife owned company
- Professional practice which incorporates
- Company which wants the ability to incentivise/reward employees with (dividend) bonuses
Income splitting with spouse

- Utilise spouse’s personal allowance / basic rate band
- HMRC historically argued that the settlements legislation applied
- Planning works provided there is an outright gift of shares (not merely a right to income)
Dividend waivers

- If there are other shareholders in the same class unless they choose to waive their rights they too would be entitled to a dividend payment.
- Requires distributable reserves equal to the total dividend declared (including amounts waived).
- The dividend waiver should be made before the right to the dividend accrues.
- Care needed where there is a succession of waivers (see Donovan & McLaren v HMRC).

Company wants to pay extra £100k to B.
Company declares dividend of £200k.
A waives the right to his £100k dividend.
B receives £100k.
Differential share classes

Issues:

• How does the company get shares into the hands of employees?
  - Tax charge on acquisition equivalent to market value
  - Employee shareholder status?

• Valuation issues
  - Consider what rights attach to the shares
  - Minority discount

Company wants to pay variable dividends.
Shares or different denominations set up (A, B, C etc.)
Further issues

• HMRC may seek to treat dividends as employment income
• Is this correct?
  - Dividends are already taxable (as investment income). S.716A ITEPA – dividend treatment takes priority
  - HMRC argue that the dividend constitutes a “post acquisition benefit), taxable under s.447(4) ITEPA if “something has been done that affects the securities” as part of a “tax avoidance arrangement”.
  - *PA Holdings* case – dividend taxed as employment income
• More likely in circumstances where dividends have been used to replace previously contractual rights or where there are huge disparities in dividends being paid to different shareholder classes
  - HMRC less likely to challenge where risk-taking is present
Final remarks

- In the current climate dividends are a more tax efficient form of reward
- Restricting salary to the extreme is likely to be viewed as provocative
- Using dividends to pay profit shares as an addition ‘top-up’ to normal salaries has lower risk (and more likely to be accepted by employees!)
- Made easier through the new employee shareholder status scheme
Realising the Capital Value for the Employee

MICHAEL DAWSON
Managing Director
T: 0161 927 3851
E: michael@forbesdawson.co.uk
Tax objectives for employee

• Capital gains treatment

• Tax free, or

• 10% with entrepreneurs’ relief
How do the shares increase in value?

Value

Minority values

Unrestricted market value

Restricted market value

Whole company

Time

Minority values
## Example – Widgets Ltd

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whole company</td>
<td>5M</td>
<td>15M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shares in issue</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro rata share value</td>
<td>£5,000</td>
<td>£15,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% share values:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unrestricted</td>
<td>£500</td>
<td>£1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restricted</td>
<td>£400</td>
<td>£1,200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Widgets Ltd – Whole company sale in 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John – 5% Holding</td>
<td>£750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost 50 x £400</td>
<td>£20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain</td>
<td>£730,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax at 10%</td>
<td>£73,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net</td>
<td>£657,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whole company sale maximises value for minority shareholders
If no company sale – alternatives

## Company Share Buy Back

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Share</th>
<th>Employee Share</th>
<th>EMI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Per share</strong></td>
<td>£10,000</td>
<td>£10,000</td>
<td>£10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CGT Treatment Conditions</strong></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 years</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tax rate</strong></td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Net receipt</strong></td>
<td>£452,000</td>
<td>£500,000</td>
<td>£360,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
If company share buy back not feasible – what next?

• Internal reorganisations
  Value good – up to £15,000?

• Employee Trust
  Minority value likely – up to £7,000?

Excess over market value subject to income tax (Grays Timber)
Company reorganisation – typical scenario
Company reorganisation – insert Holdco

- receive share for share

Cash

EMI option holders

Dividend

Spanners Ltd

Holdco

A, B, C
Company reorganisation – tax issues

- Clearance under Sections 701 ITA 2007 and 138 TCGA

- Commercial reasons; consolidate group
  separate assets from trade
  bring new shareholders into trading company (eg. as employee shareholders)

- EMI options; exercise before tradeco becomes subsidiary
Employee Trust

Employee Trust

Employee

Contribution

Spanners Ltd

Buys employee shares

From the diagram, it illustrates that the Employee Trust contributes to Spanners Ltd, which allows the Employee to acquire employee shares. The Employee Trust then purchases these shares, facilitating the incentive mechanism for the employees.
Employee Trust - Issues

• Disguised remuneration – avoid any earmarking

• How do you unwind?

• Use Guernsey purpose trust – allows surplus assets to return to sponsoring company

• Transactions in securities clearance
Conclusions

- Company sale intention makes share schemes work best

  BUT

  - Real benefits can be obtained by other routes
  - HMRC accept favourable values on issue
Thank you for Listening
Any there any Questions?